

PALM OIL GRIEVANCE LIST

(Last Updated: January 2024)

Case Number	1-2020	
Stakeholder	The Chain	
Grievance Logged Month	April 2020	
Parent Company/ Group	Tabung Haji Plantations Berhad (THP)	
Company/ Mill	Deru Semangat Sdn Bhd (DSSB)	
Sourcing Connection to Company/ Mill	Direct Connection	
Grievance Status	<input type="checkbox"/> Investigating	<input type="checkbox"/> Suspended
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Monitoring	<input type="checkbox"/> Closed
Subject Matter	Alleged deforestation	
Grievance Details	<p>The Chain report dated 9 April 2020 stated that DSSB (55% owned by Tabung Haji) has submitted an environmental impact assessment (EIA) for the development of 8,094 hectares of an oil palm plantation in Mukim Tembeling, Pahang, Malaysia.</p> <p>The proposed development is the third phase of a project which began in year 2017, covers almost 12,100 ha and located inside the Yong Forest Reserve. A High Carbon Stock (HCS) assessment has not been conducted for these developments.</p>	
Progress Update	<p>April 2020 – Goodhope engaged THP’s representative in the effort to seek clarification on the above allegation. THP reiterated its commitments with regards to the NDPE Policy. Regarding the allegation, THP clarified that they had entered into a Management Agreement with DSSB in year 2015 and THP merely acts as a management agent and is not the owner of the land.</p> <p>In year 2019, the new top management of THP which took over the realm of the THP Group became aware of this project and conveyed its intention to terminate the Management Agreement to DSSB. The parties are in the process of finalising the termination of their Management Agreement with DSSB.</p> <p>November 2020 – THP has committed to a NDPE policy which has been uploaded in their website.</p> <p>January 2021 – THP has terminated the Management Agreement with DSSB, effective from 15th January 2021.</p> <p>August 2021 – THP informed that they have signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with Global Environment Centre (GEC) to undertake a 7 years Recovery Plan Project (RPP).</p> <p>December 2022 – THP informed that their recovery plan project in partnership with GEC will focus on the long-term protection and rehabilitation of 4300 hectares in the northeast portion of the Gunung Arong Forest Reserve (GAFR). The project will support the implementation of the Johor State Peat Swamp Forest Management Plan 2023-2032 (link).</p> <p>July 2023 – THP updated their progress report of RPP from January to June 2023 (link).</p>	

Case Number	2-2020	
Stakeholder	Associated Press (AP)	
Grievance Logged Month	September 2020	
Parent Company/ Group	Felda Global Ventures (FGV) Holdings Berhad	
Company/ Mill	Felda Global Ventures Holdings Berhad	
Sourcing Connection to Company/ Mill	Direct Connection	
Grievance Status	<input type="checkbox"/> Investigating	<input type="checkbox"/> Suspended
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Monitoring	<input type="checkbox"/> Closed
Subject Matter	Alleged forced labour	
Grievance Details	<p>In September 2020, AP published an article on a set of allegations of forced labour in FGV’s operations. On 30th September 2020, the United States (US) Customs and Border Protection (CBP) issued a Withhold Release Order (WRO) that it would detain palm oil and palm oil products made by FGV, its subsidiaries and joint ventures at all U.S. ports of entry, based on information that reasonably indicates the use of forced labour.</p>	
Progress Update	<p>September 2020 – FGV released a press statement to reiterate their commitments in respecting human rights and upholding labour standards.</p> <p>October 2020 – FGV released a statement in response to the WRO issued by the CBP to emphasize that the issues raised have been the subject of public discourse since 2015 and the company has taken several steps to correct the situation, in which all efforts are well documented in the public domain. A conference call between FGV and the CBP was held on 8th October 2020 (link).</p> <p>November 2020 – AP published another article on 18th November 2020 titled “Rape, abuses in palm oil fields linked to top beauty brands”. FGV responses to the article is available here.</p> <p>December 2020 – FGV released another statement to update its steps to address the WRO issued by the CBP.</p> <p>March 2021 – FGV announced an update on its efforts to address the US CBP’s WRO. FGV also published updates on its affiliation with the Fair Labor Association (FLA) including FLA’s 2nd Assessment Report on the implementation of FGV’s action plan to enhance labour practices.</p> <p>June 2021 – FGV updates on its efforts to address the US CBP’s WRO is available here. FGV announced that they are currently calling for proposals from prospective organisations and expects to finalise the appointment of the independent auditor in August 2021, following which the assessment work will immediately begin.</p> <p>July 2021 – FGV Sustainability Updates dated 1st July 2021. In the update, FGV highlighted that they will undergo an Independent External Assessment (IEA), which will serve as a baseline examination of FGV’s implementation of its labour policies and practices on the ground. The IEA is scheduled to be conducted by FLA-accredited monitors in the third quarter of 2021, subject to the COVID-19 situation and Movement Control Order (MCO).</p>	

	<p>August 2021 – FGV released another statement to update its steps to address the WRO issued by the CBP. FGV is in the process of appointing an independent auditing firm to assess its operations against the 11 International Labour Organization (ILO) Indicators of Forced Labour. The appointment is expected to be finalized in September 2021.</p> <p>October 2021 – FGV’s Updates on the US CBP’s WRO dated 20th October 2021. FGV has identified an independent auditor to carry out the audit work and is currently working with a US-based legal counsel to finalise the terms and conditions for the appointment. In ensuring that the scope and methodology of the audit meet the requirements and expectations of the CBP, FGV foresees a slight delay in the appointment and expects to formalise the appointment by November 2021.</p> <p>November 2021 – FGV announced the appointment of ELEVATE, an experienced sustainability and supply chain service provider, as the independent auditing firm to assess FGV’s operations against the 11 ILO Indicators of Forced Labour. On 30th November 2021, FGV stated that the site assessments by ELEVATE is expected to commence in the first half of 2022 (link).</p> <p>August 2022 – FGV released a press statement to announce that no non-compliances and no evidence of child labour are identified at FGV’s operations based on the recently published IEA report by FLA. The IEA was conducted by FLA in the period of November 2021 and January 2022, based on the FLA’s Workplace Code of Conduct (WCOC), which is derived from international labour standards and internationally accepted good labour practices. Goodhope will continue monitor FGV’s progress in addressing the allegations for the lifting of the WRO.</p> <p>January 2024 – FGV released another press statement updating that they have set aside RM112 million to reimburse recruitment fees to its migrant workers, including former migrant workers. The reimbursements were distributed in three tranches in March, June, and September 2023. As of now, a sum of RM72.2 million has been reimbursed to 19,673 workers. FGV appointed LRQA, formerly known as ELEVATE to conduct a verification of the reimbursement exercise.</p>
--	---

Case Number	1-2021	
Stakeholder	Liberty Shared	
Grievance Logged Month	January 2021	
Parent Company/ Group	Sime Darby Plantation Berhad (SDP)	
Company/ Mill	Sime Darby Plantation Berhad	
Sourcing Connection to Company/ Mill	Direct Connection	
Grievance Status	<input type="checkbox"/> Investigating	<input type="checkbox"/> Suspended
	<input type="checkbox"/> Monitoring	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Closed
Subject Matter	Alleged forced labour	
Grievance Details	In April 2020, Liberty Shared (LS) submitted a petition to U.S. Customs and Border Protection alleging forced labour in Sime Darby Plantation. SDP responded to the LS Petition’s allegations in July 2020 by expressing their review of the matters raised, as well as their existing practices and challenges.	

	<p>Subsequently, U.S. Customs and Border Protection (US CBP) issued a Withhold Release Order (WRO) against SDP on 30th December 2020, based on information that reasonably indicates the presence of all 11 of the International Labour Organization’s forced labour indicators in SDP’s production process. It was noted that RSPO have launched an immediate investigation pertaining to this matter as well.</p>
<p>Progress Update</p>	<p>February 2021 – SDP highlighted their commitments in addressing the WRO issued by conducting internal assessments of their entire Malaysian operations. This internal assessment has revealed no systematic labour issues in their operations. Nonetheless, they will engage independent assessors to conduct third party expert checks to ensure a safe and nurturing environment for their workers. Link</p> <p>March 2021 – SDP established Expert Stakeholder Human Rights Assessment Commission (the Commission) and appointed Impactt Ltd, an ethical trade consultancy as a third-party assessor to conduct a detailed evaluation of SDP’s labour practices across their Malaysian operations. Link</p> <p>June 2021 – SDP appointed Professor Justine Nolan, a Human Rights lawyer with over 20 years of experience to the Commission, in the effort to provide additional views on the Impactt’s assessment methodology and any proposed recommendations. Link</p> <p>July 2021 – SDP released a press statement indicating that they have dissolved the Commission while the independent assessment still on going. Due to the Covid-19 travel restriction imposed by the Malaysian government, the Impactt’s assessment was unable to be completed within the targeted timeline. Link</p> <p>January 2022 – US CBP determined that certain SDP palm oil products are produced using forced labour in SDP’s Malaysian operations on 28th January 2022 through its investigation. In response, SDP released a press statement indicating their commitments to cooperate with US CBP to demonstrate full compliance with US import regulations. Link</p> <p>February 2022 – SDP announced their commitments to improve its governance structures, policies and procedures, which include reimbursement of recruitment fees to present and past migrant workers (allocation of RM82.02 million); revised Responsible Recruitment Procedure in which routine due diligence will be conducted on appointed recruitment agents and those agents in breach of SDP’s ethical recruitment standards will be terminated; introduction of a new two-way communication platform which allows workers to raise any issue to the management for resolution, as well as allows management to share information with workers more effectively.</p> <p>Besides, in the efforts to ensure all the improvements are implemented accordingly, some of the key structural changes highlighted in the press release include establishment of Social Welfare & Services (SWS) department, implementation of an ESG scorecard with clear indicators and appointment of 40 Site Safety & Sustainability Officers (SSSO). Link</p> <p>April 2022 – It is reported that SDP has submitted their Impactt report to US CBP.</p>

	<p>November 2022 – SDP’s Response Letter to RSPO’s Decision Letter dated 14th November 2022 (Link); SDP’s Submission of Action Plan to RSPO (Link).</p> <p>February 2023 – US CBP lifted its WRO against SDP based on satisfactory evidence that SDP no longer produce palm oil and its derivative products using forced labour (Link); Press statement from SDP (Link).</p>
--	---

Case Number	1-2022	
Stakeholder	Earthqualizer	
Grievance Logged Month	January 2022	
Parent Company/ Group	PT Permata Sawit Mandiri	
Company/ Mill	PT Permata Sawit Mandiri (PT PSM)	
Sourcing Connection to Company/ Mill	Direct Connection	
Grievance Status	<input type="checkbox"/> Investigating	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Suspended
	<input type="checkbox"/> Monitoring	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Closed
Subject Matter	Alleged deforestation	
Grievance Details	PT PSM allegedly cleared over 4,500 hectares of forest between year 2016 and 2020, as well as another 350 hectares in year 2021.	
Progress Update	<p>January 2022 – Goodhope attempted to reach out and engage representative from PT PSM, but to no avail. Taking into consideration on the severity of the above allegation, outcome of the discussion with Earthqualizer team, and in line with Goodhope’s NDPE commitments- that is no development on HCS forest, Goodhope sent a letter to PT PSM informing that PT Batu Mas Sejahtera Mill (PT BMS) will not further accept their crops (FFBs) directly or via other aggregators. Additional step has been taken by PT BMS’s team to ensure that no vehicles from PT PSM to enter the mill gates.</p>	

Case Number	2-2022	
Stakeholder	Mighty Earth, Rapid Response (RR) Palm Oil Report	
Grievance Logged Month	February 2022	
Parent Company/ Group	Mr Chow Chuin Hai (group held companies)	
Company/ Mill	Jernih Kemboja Palm Oil Mill (JK)	
Sourcing Connection to Company/ Mill	Direct Connection	
Grievance Status	<input type="checkbox"/> Investigating	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Suspended
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Monitoring	<input type="checkbox"/> Closed
Subject Matter	Alleged deforestation	
Grievance Details	<p>Based on RR Report 38, a total of ~25 hectares of forest was cleared in the PTD 1815 concession between February 2021 and January 2022. Project Proponent for PTD 1815 concession is AA Sawit Sdn Bhd (AA Sawit) which is 49% owned by Mr Chow Chuin Hai. Mr Chow Chuin Hai owns 54% of SH Trading Co Kluang Sdn Bhd (FFB trader) and 100% Jernih Kemboja POM.</p> <p>Besides, AA Sawit and SH Trading Co Kluang Sdn Bhd are named as two major FFB suppliers (~95%) to the Jernih Kemboja POM according to trade data for 2020 and 2021.</p>	

	<p>RR Report 40 reported a total of 636 hectares of forest loss in the PTD 4882, 4085, 4963, 4118, 4177 and 4121 concessions, between January 2020 and December 2021. Project Proponent for these concessions is also reported to be AA Sawit Sdn Bhd.</p>
<p>Progress Update</p>	<p>March 2022 – Goodhope engaged JK’s representative in the effort to seek clarification on the above allegation. Goodhope takes our NDPE commitments seriously and we have communicated our expectations to JK that an integrated HCV-HCSA assessment is required prior to any new oil palm development.</p> <p>JK responded that neither JK nor AA Sawit are the landowner of PTD 1815 and AA Sawit has not carried out any land clearing work since June 2021. Trading activity with JK has currently been put on hold pending further investigations.</p> <p>June 2022 – JK informed that they have adopted a NDPE Policy, implemented a stop-work order on all new developments that involve natural forest conversion, as well as plan to engage independent third parties to review and understand potential liability of their new developments.</p>